Evidence review: Analysis of the evidence for Out-of-Home Care

Appendix 3

June 2013

Parenting Research Centre and the University of Melbourne

Commissioned by the Community Services
Directorate of the ACT Government





# Prepared by:

# Prof Aron Shlonsky, PhD

Professor of Evidence Informed Practice, Department of Social Work, School of Health Sciences, University of Melbourne

### **Dr Margaret Kertesz**

Research Fellow, Department of Social Work, School of Health Sciences, University of Melbourne

#### Dr Michelle Macvean, PhD

Manager, Knowledge Synthesis, Parenting Research Centre

#### Ms Zvezdana Petrovic

Research Officer, Parenting Research Centre

#### Mr Ben Devine

Research Assistant, Parenting Research Centre

#### Ms Jessica Falkiner

Research Assistant, Parenting Research Centre

# Dr Fabrizio D'Esposito, PhD

Research Fellow, Parenting Research Centre

### Dr Robyn Mildon, PhD

Director of Knowledge Exchange and Implementation, Parenting Research Centre

# Disclaimer

This analysis of Out-of-Home-Care was commissioned by the Community Service Directorate of the ACT Government. It was conducted between April and June 2013. Readers are advised to consider new evidence arising post the publication of this review when selecting and implementing parenting interventions.

June 2013

Parenting Research Centre Level 5, 232 Victoria Parade East Melbourne Victoria 3002 Australia p. + 61 03 8660 3500 www.parentingrc.org.au

# **CONTENTS**

APPENDIX 3: EFFECTIVENESS RATINGS OF OOHC INTERVENTIONS	
INCLUDED IN THE REA	1
References	6

# APPENDIX 3: EFFECTIVENESS RATINGS OF OOHC INTERVENTIONS INCLUDED IN THE REA

Intervention name (description - where name not available)	Intervention type	Place on the continuum	Studies
	W	ell Supported	
Multidimensional Treatment Foster Care (MTFC)	Service model	Therapeutic/treatment foster care	Chamberlain 2008 Chamberlain et al. 2004 Eddy & Chamberlain, 2000 Hansson & Olsson, 2012 Harold et al. 2013 Smith et al. 2010 Van Ryzin & Leve, 2012 Westermark et al. 2011
		Supported	
Attachment and Biobehavioral Catch- up (ABC)	Program	Foster care	Dozier et al. 2006; 2009 Lewis-Morrarty et al. 2012 Sprang, 2009
Multidimensional Treatment Foster Care for Preschoolers (MTFC-P) (previously called Early Intervention Foster Care Program (EIFC))	Service model	Therapeutic/treatment foster care  Foster care and Placement preservation/Placement stability	Bruce et al. 2009 Fisher et al. 2005 Fisher & Kim, 2007 Fisher & Stoolmiller, 2008 Fisher et al. 2009
TAKE CHARGE	Program	Foster care  OOHC/Looked after children and transition from care/leaving care	Geenen et al. 2012 Powers et al. 2012

Intervention name (description - where name not available)	Intervention type	Place on the continuum	Studies
		Promising	
	NC	NE IDENTIFIED	
		Emerging	
Assertive Continuing Care (ACC)	Service model	Transition from care/leaving care	Godley et al. 2007
Big Brothers-Big Sisters	Service model	Foster care and kinship care	Rhodes et al. 1999
Combined Cognitive Behavioural program and educational program	Program	Adoption and permanency	Rushton et al. 2010 Sharac et al. 2011
Fostering Healthy Futures (FHF)	Program	OOHC/Looked after children	Taussig & Culhane, 2010 Taussig et al. 2012
Kids in Transition to School (KITS)	Program	Foster care and kinship care	Pears et al. 2012
Life Story Intervention (LSI)	Program	Foster care and kinship care	Haight et al. 2005 Haight et al. 2010
Middle School Success	Program	Foster care	Kim & Leve, 2011
Together Facing the Challenge (enhanced Treatment Foster Care)	Program	Therapeutic/treatment foster care	Farmer et al. 2010
Pending			
Alameda Project	System of care	Foster care	Stein & Gambrill, 1979
Connecticut Waiver Demonstration Project Local Service Agencies	Service model	OOHC / Looked after Children, foster care, kinship care, residential	Holden et al. 2007

Intervention name (description - where name not available)	Intervention type	Place on the continuum	Studies
		care / children's homes, placement prevention, transition from care / leaving care	
Home visitation - description	Service model	Placement prevention	Marcenko et al. 1996
Early Citizen Review	Service model	OOHC/Looked After Children, placement prevention, restoration/family reunification, adoption and permanency	Jennings et al. 1996
Families for Iowa's Children (FIC)	Program	Foster care, kinship care, reception services / shelter care, restoration / family reunification, adoption and permanency	Landsman & Boel-Studt, 2011
Fostering Individualized Assistance Program (FIAP)	Service model	Foster care, placement preservation / placement	Clark et al. 1994 Clark et al. 1996
Incredible Years Parenting Program	Program	Foster care, short term care	Bywater et al. 2011 Linares et al. 2006
Keeping Foster Parents Trained and Supported (KEEP)	Program	Foster care, kinship care	Chamberlain et al. 2008b; 2008c Price et al. 2008
Multisystemic Therapy (MST) adapted for youth with SED (serious emotional disturbance)	Service model	Foster care, kinship care, placement prevention	Rowland et al. 2005

Intervention name (description - where name not available)	Intervention type	Place on the continuum	Studies
Project Focus	Service model	Foster care	Dorsey, 2012
Promoting First Relationships (PFR)	Program	Foster care, kinship care	Spieker et al. 2012
Ross Program	Program	Residential care, children's homes	Curran & Bull, 2009
SafeCare	Program	Placement prevention	Aarons & Sommerfeld, 2012
Teach Your Children Well (TYCW)	Program	Foster care	Flynn et al. 2012
well (Trew)		Kinship care	Harper & Schmidt, 2012
	Insu	fficient Evidence	
Intervention for foster parents and girls - description	Program	Foster care, kinship care, adoption and permanency	Smith et al. 2011
Therapy for children in foster care - description	Service model	Foster care, placement prevention	De Fries et al. 1964
Family-Centered Intensive Case Management (FCICM)	Service model	Placement prevention	Evans et al. 1996
Failed to Demonstrate Effect			
Anger Control	Program	Residential care/ children's homes, placement preservation/placement stability	Moore & Shannon, 1993
Child and Adolescent Service System Program (CASSP) framework - Stark	System of care	Placement prevention	Bickman et al. 2000b

Intervention name (description - where name not available)	Intervention type	Place on the continuum	Studies
County			
Child Training	Program	OOHC /Looked after Children	Linares et al. 2012
Cognitively-Based Compassion Training (CBCT)	Program	Foster care	Reddy et al. 2013
Community mental health care - description	Program	Foster care	Love et al. 2008
Family Group Decision Making (FGDM)	Program	Foster care, placement preservation/placement stability, adoption and permanency	Berzin et al. 2008
Concerning Practice			
NONE IDENTIFIED			

# References

- Aarons, G. A., & Sommerfeld, D. H. (2012). Leadership, innovation climate, and attitudes toward evidence-based practice during a statewide implementation. *Journal of the American Academy of Child & Adolescent Psychiatry*, *51*(4), 423-431.
- Berzin, S. C., Cohen, E., Thomas, K., & Dawson, W. C. (2008). Does family group decision making affect child welfare outcomes? Findings from a randomized control study. *Child Welfare*, 87(4), 35-54.
- Bickman, L., Noser, K., & Summerfelt, W. T. (200b). Long-term effects of a system of care on children and adolescents. *The Journal of Behavioural Health Services & Research*, 26(2), 185-202.
- Bruce, J., McDermott, J. M., Fisher, P. A., & Fox, N. A. (2009). Using behavioral and electrophysiological measures to assess the effects of a preventive intervention: A preliminary study with preschool-aged foster children. *Prevention Science*, *10*(2), 129-140.
- Bywater, T., Hutchings, J., Linck, P., Whitaker, C., Daley, D., Yeo, S. T., & Edwards, R. T. (2011). Incredible Years parent training support for foster carers in Wales: A multi-centre feasibility study. *Child: Care, Health & Development, 37*(2), 233-243.
- Chamberlain, P., Eddy, J. M., & Whaley, R. B. (2004). The prevention of violent behavior by chronic and serious male juvenile offenders: a 2-year follow-up of a randomized clinical trial. *Journal of Emotional and Behavioral Disorders*, *12*(1), 2-8.
- Chamberlain, P., Brown, C., Saldana, L., Reid, J., Wang, W., Marsenich, L., . . . Bouwman, G. (2008). Engaging and recruiting counties in an experiment on implementing evidence-based practice in California. *Administration and Policy in Mental Health and Mental Health Services Research*, 35(4), 250-260.
- Chamberlain, P., Price, J., Leve, L. D., Laurent, H., Landsverk, J. A., & Reid, J. B. (2008b).

  Prevention of behavior problems for children in foster care: outcomes and mediation effects. *Prevention Science*, *9*(1), 17-27.
- Chamberlain, P., Price, J., Reid, J., & Landsverk, J. (2008c). Cascading implementation of a foster and kinship parent intervention. *Child Welfare*, *87*(5), 27-48.
- Clark, H. B., Prange, M. E., Lee, B., Boyd, L., McDonald, B. A., & Stewart, E. S. (1994). Improving Adjustment Outcomes For Foster Children With Emotional And Behavioral Disorders. Early Findings From A Controlled Study On Individualized Services. *Journal of Emotional and Behavioral Disorders*, 2(4), 207-218. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/106342669400200403
- Clark, H. B., Lee, B., Prange, M. E., & McDonald, B. A. (1996). Children lost within the foster care system: Can wraparound service strategies improve placement outcomes? *Journal of Child and Family Studies*, *5*(1), 39-54.

- Curran, J., & Bull, R. (2009). Ross Programme: Effectiveness with Young People in Residential Childcare. *Psychiatry, Psychology and Law, 16*, S81-S89. doi: <a href="http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13218710802242029">http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13218710802242029</a>
- De Fries, Z., Jenkins, S., & Williams, E. C. (1964). Treatment of disturbed children in Foster care. American Journal of Orthopsychiatry, 34(4), 615-624.
- Dorsey, S., Kerns, S. E. U., Trupin, E. W., Conover, K. L., & Berliner, L. (2012). Child welfare caseworkers as service brokers for youth in foster care: Findings from project focus. *Child Maltreatment*, *17*(1), 22-31.
- Dozier, M., Peloso, E., Lindhiem, O., Gordon, M., Manni, M., Sepulveda, S., Ackerman, J., Bernier, A., & Levine, S. (2006). Developing evidence-based interventions for foster children: An example of a randomized clinical trial with infants and toddlers. *Journal of Social Issues*, 62(4), 767-785. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-4560.2006.00486.x
- Dozier, M., Lindhiem, O., Lewis, E., Bick, J., Bernard, K., & Peloso, E. (2009). Effects of a foster parent training program on young children's attachment behaviors: Preliminary evidence from a randomized clinical trial. *Child & Adolescent Social Work Journal*, 26(4), 321-332.
- Eddy, J., & Chamberlain, P. (2000). Family managment and deviant peer association as mediators of the impact of treatment condition on youth antisocial behavior. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology, 68*(5), 857-863.
- Evans, M. E., Armstrong, M. I., & Kuppinger, A. D. (1996). Family-Centered Intensive Case Management: A Step Toward Understanding Individualized Care. *Journal of Child and Family Studies*, *5*(1), 55-65.
- Farmer, E. M. Z., Burns, B. J., Wagner, H. R., Murray, M., & Southerland, D. G. (2010). Enhancing "usual practice" treatment foster care: Findings from a randomized trial on improving youths' outcomes. *Psychiatric Services*, *61*(6), 555-561.
- Fisher, P. A., Burraston, B., & Pears, K. (2005). The early intervention foster care program:

  Permanent placement outcomes from a randomized trial. *Child Maltreatment*, *10*(1), 61-71.
- Fisher, P. A., & Kim, H. K. (2007). Intervention effects on foster preschoolers' attachment-related behaviors from a randomized trial. *Prevention Science*, 8(2), 161-170.
- Fisher, P. A., & Stoolmiller, M. (2008). Intervention effects on foster parents stress: Associations with child cortisol levels. *Development and Psychopathology*, *20*(3), 1003-1021.
- Fisher, P. A., Kim, H. K., & Pears, K. C. (2009). Effects of Multidimensional Treatment Foster Care for Preschoolers (MTFC-P) on reducing permanent placement failures among children with placement instability. *Children and Youth Services Review, 31*(5), 541-546. doi: 10.1016/j.childyouth.2008.10.012
- Flynn. R. J., Marquis, R. A., Paquet, M-P., Peeke, L. M., & Aubry, T. D. (2012). Effects of individual

- direct-instruction tutoring on foster children's academic skills: A randomised trial. *Children and Youth Services Review, 34,* 1183-1189.
- Geenen, S., Powers, L. E., Powers, J., Cunningham, M., McMahon, L., Nelson, M., Dalton, L. D., Swank, P., & Fullerton, A. (2012). Experimental study of a self-determination intervention for youth in foster care. *Career Development and Transition for Exceptional Individuals*. doi: 10.1177/2165143412455431
- Godley, M. D., Godley, S. H., Dennis, M. L., Funk, R. R., & Passetti, L. L. (2007). The effect of assertive continuing care on continuing care linkage, adherence and abstinence following residential treatment for adolescents with substance use disorders. *Addiction*, 102(1), 81-93. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1360-0443.2006.01648.x
- Haight, W., Black, J., & Sheridan, K. (2010). A mental health intervention for rural, foster children from methamphetamine-involved families: Experimental assessment with qualitative elaboration. *Children and Youth Services Review, 32*(10), 1446-1457. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.childyouth.2010.06.024
- Haight, W. L., Mangelsdorf, S., Black, J., Szewczyk, M., Schoppe, S., Giorgio, G., Madrigal, K., & Tata, L. (2005). Enhancing parent-child interaction during foster care visits: Experimental assessment of an intervention. *Child Welfare*, *84*(4), 459-481.
- Hansson, K., & Olsson, M. (2012). Effects of multidimensional treatment foster care (MTFC):

  Results from a RCT study in Sweden. *Children and Youth Services Review, 34*(9), 1929-1936. doi: 10.1016/j.childyouth.2012.06.008
- Harold, G. T., Kerr, D. C. R., Van Ryzin, M., DeGarmo, D. S., Rhoades, K. A., & Leve, L. D. (2013). Depressive symptom trajectories among girls in the juvenile justice system: 24-month outcomes of an RCT of multidimensional treatment foster care. *Prevention Science*.
- Harper, J., & Schmidt, F. (2012). Preliminary effects of a group-based tutoring program for children in long-term foster care. *Children and Youth Services Review, 34*(6), 1176-1182.
- Holden, E., O'Connell, S. R., Liao, Q., Krivelyova, A., Connor, T., Blau, G., & Long, D. (2007).

  Outcomes of a randomized trial of continuum of care services for children in a child welfare system. *Child Welfare: Journal of Policy, Practice, and Program, 86*(6), 89-114.
- Jennings, M. A., McDonald, T., & Henderson, R. A. (1996). Early citizen review: does it make a difference? *Social Work, 41*(2), 224-231.
- Kim, H. K., & Leve, L. D. (2011). Substance use and delinquency among middle school girls in foster care: A three year follow up of a randomised controlled trial. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology, 79*(6), 740-750
- Landsman, M. J., & Boel-Studt, S. (2011). Fostering families' and children's rights to family connections. *Child Welfare*, *90*(4), 19-40.

- Lewis-Morrarty, E., Dozier, M., Bernard, K., Terracciano, S. M., & Moore, S. V. (2012). Cognitive flexibility and theory of mind outcomes among foster children: Preschool follow-up results of a randomized clinical trial. *Journal of Adolescent Health*, *51*(2 Suppl), S17-22.
- Linares, L. O., Montalto, D., Li, M., & Oza, V. S. (2006). A promising parenting intervention in foster care. *Journal of Consulting & Clinical Psychology*, 74(1), 32-41.
- Linares, L. O., Li, M. M., & Shrout, P. E. (2012). Child training for physical aggression? Lessons from foster care. *Children and Youth Services Review, 34*(12), 2416-2422. doi: 10.1016/j.childyouth.2012.08.010
- Love, S. M., Koob, J. J., & Hill, L. E. (2008). The effects of using community mental health practitioners to treat foster children: Implications for child welfare planners. *The Scientific Review of Mental Health Practice: Objective Investigations of Controversial and Unorthodox Claims in Clinical Psychology, Psychiatry, and Social Work, 6*(1), 31-39.
- Marcenko, M. O., Spence, M., & Samost, L. (1996). Outcomes of a home visitation trial for pregnant and postpartum women at-risk for child placement. *Children and Youth Services Review*, *18*(3), 243-259. doi: 10.1016/0190-7409(96)00003-5
- Moore, K. J., & Shannon, K. K. (1993). The development of superstitious beliefs in the effectiveness of treatment of anger: Evidence for the importance of experimental program evaluation in applied settings. *Behavioral Residential Treatment*, 8(2), 147-161.
- Pears, K. C., Kim, H. K., & Fisher, P. A. (2012). Effects of a school readiness intervention for children in foster care on oppositional and aggressive behaviors in kindergarten. *Children and Youth Services Review, 34*(12), 2361-2366.
- Powers, L. E., Geenen, S., Powers, J., Pommier-Satya, S., Turner, A., Dalton, L. D., Drummond, D., & Swank, P. (2012). My life: Effects of a longitudinal, randomized study of self-determination enhancement on the transition outcomes of youth in foster care and special education. *Children and Youth Services Review, 34*(11), 2179-2187.
- Price, J. M., Chamberlain, P., Landsverk, J., Reid, J. B., Leve, L. D., & Laurent, H. (2008). Effects of a foster parent training intervention on placement changes of children in foster care. *Effects of Intervention on Placement Changes*, 13(1), 64-75.
- Reddy, S. D., Negi, L. T., Dodson-Lavelle, B., Ozawa-de Silva, B., Pace, T. W. W., Cole, S. P., Raison, C. L., & Craighead, L. W. (2013). Cognitive-Based Compassion Training: A Promising Prevention Strategy for At-Risk Adolescents. *Journal of Child and Family Studies*, 22(2), 219-230. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10826-012-9571-7
- Rhodes, J. E., Haight, W. L., & Briggs, E. C. (1999). The influence of mentoring on the peer relationships of foster youth in relative and nonrelative care. *Journal of Research on Adolescence*, 9(2), 185-201.
- Rowland, M. D., Halliday-Boykins, C. A., Henggeler, S. W., Cunningham, P. B., Lee, T. G., Kruesi, M. J. P., & Shapiro, S. B. (2005). A randomized trial of multisystemic therapy with Hawaii's Felix class youths. *Journal of Emotional & Behavioral Disorders*, *13*(1), 13-23.

- Rushton, A., Monck, E., Leese, M., McCrone, P., & Sharac, J. (2010). Enhancing adoptive parenting: A randomized controlled trial. *Clinical Child Psychology & Psychiatry*, 15(4), 529-542.
- Sharac, J., McCrone, P., Rushton, A., & Monck, E. (2011). Enhancing Adoptive Parenting: A Cost-Effectiveness Analysis. *Child & Adolescent Mental Health, 16*(2), 110-115. doi: 10.1111/j.1475-3588.2010.00587.x
- Smith, D. K., Chamberlain, P., & Eddy, J. M. (2010). Preliminary support for multidimensional treatment foster care in reducing substance use in delinquent boys. *Journal of Child & Adolescent Substance Abuse*, 19(4), 343-358. doi: 10.1080/1067828x.2010.511986
- Smith, D. K., Leve, L. D., & Chamberlain, P. (2011). Preventing internalising and externalising problems in girls in foster care as they enter middle school: Impact of an intervention. *Prevention science*, 12, 269-277
- Sprang, G. (2009). The efficacy of a relational treatment for maltreated children and their families. *Child and Adolescent Mental Health, 14*(2), 81-88. doi: 10.1111/j.1475-3588.2008.00499.x
- Spieker, S. J., Oxford, M. L., Kelly, J. F., Nelson, E. M., & Fleming, C. B. (2012). Promoting First Relationships: Randomized Trial of a Relationship-Based Intervention for Toddlers in Child Welfare. *Child Maltreatment*, *17*(4), 271-286. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/1077559512458176
- Stein, T. J., & Gambrill, E. D. (1979). The Alameda Project: A two year report and one year follow up. *Child Abuse and Neglect*, *3*, 521-528.
- Taussig, H. N., & Culhane, S. E. (2010). Impact of a mentoring and skills group program on mental health outcomes for maltreated children in foster care. *Archives of Pediatrics & Adolescent Medicine*, *164*(8), 739-746.
- Taussig, H. N., Culhane, S. E., Garrido, E., & Knudtson, M. D. (2012). RCT of a mentoring and skills group program: Placement and permanency outcomes for foster youth. *Pediatrics*, 130(1), 33-39.
- Van Ryzin, M. J., & Leve, L. D. (2012). Affiliation with delinquent peers as a mediator of the effects of multidimensional treatment foster care for delinquent girls. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 80(4), 588-596. doi: 10.1037/a0027336
- Westermark, P. K., Hansson, K., & Olsson, M. (2011). Multidimensional treatment foster care (MTFC): Results from an independent replication. *Journal of Family Therapy, 33*(1), 20-41. doi: 10.1111/j.1467-6427.2010.00515.x



Level 5, 232 Victoria Parade, East Melbourne, Victoria, Australia 3002

E: info@parentingrc.org.au

P: +61 3 8660 3500 F: +61 3 8660 3599

W: www.parentingrc.org.au

Level 7, 161 Barry Street Carlton, Victoria, Australia 3010

E: socialwork-enquiries@unimelb.edu.au

P: +61 3 8344 4171 F: +61 3 8344 4188

W: www.healthsciences.unimelb.edu.au